

Diversity for redlegged earth mite cotyledon resistance within subterranean clover and annual medics

Phillip G.H. Nichols^{1,2}, Parwinder Kaur¹, David Peck³, Bradley J Wintle^{1,2}, Mario D'Antuono⁴ and William Erskine¹

¹School of Agriculture and Environment and Institute of Agriculture, University of Western Australia, 35 Stirling Highway, Perth WA 6009, www.uwa.edu.au, phillip.nichols@uwa.edu.au

²Formerly Department of Primary Industries and Regional Development, 3 Baron-Hay Court, South Perth WA 6151

³South Australian Research and Development Institute, GPO Box 397, Adelaide SA 5001

⁴Department of Primary Industries and Regional Development, 3 Baron-Hay Court, South Perth WA 6151

Abstract

Redlegged earth mites (RLEM) are a major pest of subterranean clover and annual medics, particularly during seedling establishment. Five new subterranean clover cultivars have recently been released with improved resistance, but all annual medic cultivars are previously reported as susceptible. This paper reports on glasshouse experiments that found wide diversity for RLEM cotyledon resistance among the 97-member core collection of subterranean clover (*Trifolium subterraneum*), representing ~80% of the total diversity within the species, and 48 cultivars. Diversity for resistance was also found among 153 annual medic lines in 11 different *Medicago* species, including 36 cultivars. The detection of new sources of RLEM cotyledon resistance will assist breeders to develop subterranean clovers and annual medics with improved resistance.

Key Words

Redlegged earth mites, subterranean clover, annual medics, pest resistance

Introduction

Redlegged earth mites (RLEM), *Halotydeus destructor*, are found throughout the winter growing-season areas of southern Australia. These mites feed on the upper surface of cotyledons and leaves of annual legumes, including subterranean clover (*Trifolium subterraneum*) and annual medics (*Medicago* spp.), causing high mortality of germinating seedlings, loss of herbage production in winter and spring and a reduction in seed yield (Ridsdill-Smith and Nichols 1998). Insecticides have been the main form of control, but some populations have been found with resistance to some pyrethroid pesticides (Umina 2007).

Genetic variation for RLEM cotyledon resistance has been found in subterranean clover and breeding for resistance to this trait has led to the recent release of cultivars Bindoon, Rosabrook, Narrikup, Tammin and Forbes (Nichols *et al.* 2014; PBR database 2019). However, less than 10% of accessions in the Australian Pastures Genebank have been screened for RLEM resistance and the diversity within subterranean clover is poorly defined. Furthermore, the resistance in the new cultivars is not absolute and high RLEM densities are able to overcome it. Variation for seedling resistance to RLEM in annual medics has been reported by Lake and Howie (1995), but all cultivars were reported as highly susceptible. This paper reports on two glasshouse experiments to examine diversity for RLEM cotyledon resistance among diverse collections of subterranean clover and annual medics, in order to find new sources of resistance for breeding.

Methods

The first experiment, sown on 29 July in 2014, examined diversity within subterranean clover for reaction to RLEM attack. This trial screened the 97-member core collection, which includes cultivars Coolamon (L96) and Urana (L97) (Nichols *et al.* 2013; Kaur *et al.* 2017), and 44 extra cultivars (see Table 1). Cultivar Dalkeith and the RLEM-resistant core collection line L58 (accession DGI007) were used as susceptible and resistant controls, respectively. The second experiment, sown on 20 August in 2015, examined 153 annual medic lines in 11 *Medicago* species, including 36 cultivars and 68 members of the *M. truncatula* core collection (Ellwood *et al.* 2006) (see Table 2), along with the most resistant lines found by Lake and Howie (1995). Twelve subterranean clover cultivars and messina (*Melilotus siculus*) cv. Neptune were also added. L58 (DGI007) subterranean clover and the barrel medic cultivar Jemalong were used as resistant and susceptible controls, respectively.

Seeds were sown into plastic boxes of size 400 mm x 300 mm and 120 mm depth. Six 8 mm diameter holes were drilled into the bottom of each box for drainage. A layer of paper towelling was placed in the bottom of

each box before filling them with pasteurised river sand. The sand was wetted and levelled to achieve an even depth of 60 mm. Sticky tape was applied to the top perimeter of each box and Vaseline petroleum jelly was smeared on top of this to prevent RLEM movement between boxes. Both trials used a row-column design with 4 replicates. Sixteen entries were allocated per box in two rows of eight. The resistant and susceptible check varieties were included in randomised positions in each box. Rows of each entry were sown with 0.2 grams of scarified seed to a depth of 5 mm. Sowing furrows were then lightly covered over with sand. Boxes were watered daily prior to introduction of RLEM.

RLEM were collected from the field 8 days after sowing using a Stihl garden Vacblower, modified for suction. A 150 µm mesh cup was used to trap mites. RLEM samples were placed into a stack of sieves, with mesh diameter 710 µm and 375 µm and a solid base. The majority of RLEMs passed through the 710 µm sieve and were retained by the 375 µm sieve. This sieved sample was placed in a plastic container inside a portable refrigerator for transport back to the laboratory. Further sieving was conducted to standardise the sample and eliminate other organisms. The mites applied to seedlings passed through a 600 µm sieve and were retained by a 375 µm sieve. A total of 0.25 grams of RLEM were applied to the centre of each box. RLEM moved rapidly from this position and within 15 minutes were distributed across each box. RLEM feeding damage ratings were conducted 7 days after introduction. Damage was visually scored as the percentage of cotyledon area silvered in each seedling row. AS-REML was used to produce predicted means for percent cotyledon damage with varieties as random effects.

Results

Subterranean clover

There was a wide separation between the resistant check, L58 (DGI007), and the susceptible check, Dalkeith (Table 1). A wide range of damage ratings occurred across the 142 entries, with silvering ranging from 17.8% for cv. Narrikup to several entries with 100%. The three other newly released cultivars with cotyledon resistance, Bindoon, Rosabrook and Tammin, also had low damage scores, while the remaining cultivars, apart from Denmark and Woogenellup, had high damage scores. Also of note were other core collection lines (notably L15, L30, L31, L41, L50, L53, L68, L75 and L93) with low RLEM damage scores.

Table 1. Predicted means (from AS-REML) for percent cotyledon damage of subterranean clover core collection lines and cultivars following glasshouse screening with RLEM. Resistant and susceptible check varieties, L58 (DGI007) and Dalkeith, respectively, are highlighted in bold.

| Core collection lines | | | | Cultivars | | | | | | | |
|-----------------------|----------|---------|----------|------------|-------------|---------|----------|-----------------|-------------|-------------|----------|
| Line no | % damage | Line no | % damage | Line no | % damage | Line no | % damage | Cultivar | % damage | Cultivar | % damage |
| L01 | 79.2 | L25 | 94.5 | L49 | 94.3 | L73 | 69.7 | Antas | 93.0 | Losa | 72.5 |
| L02 | 98.6 | L26 | 65.6 | L50 | 30.4 | L74 | 43.3 | Bacchus Marsh | 65.0 | Meteora | 99.8 |
| L03 | 96.8 | L27 | 91.9 | L51 | 90.6 | L75 | 22.7 | Bindoon | 20.4 | Mintaro | 97.3 |
| L04 | 97.4 | L28 | 94.7 | L52 | 97.8 | L76 | 96.8 | Campeda | 51.8 | Monti | 100.6 |
| L05 | 93.3 | L29 | 68.9 | L53 | 34.5 | L77 | 96.4 | Clare | 87.2 | Mt Barker | 91.3 |
| L06 | 77.1 | L30 | 32.9 | L54 | 97.8 | L78 | 72.6 | Coolamon (L96) | 74.5 | Nangeela | 74.9 |
| L07 | 72.0 | L31 | 38.2 | L55 | 99.1 | L79 | 97.1 | Daliak | 98.3 | Napier | 97.1 |
| L08 | 99.3 | L32 | 79.2 | L56 | 100.5 | L80 | 70.7 | Dalkeith | 83.3 | Narrikup | 17.8 |
| L09 | 100.2 | L33 | 96.8 | L57 | 98.7 | L81 | 95.6 | Denmark | 30.8 | Northam | 93.2 |
| L10 | 69.0 | L34 | 87.1 | L58 | 20.8 | L82 | 87.7 | Dinninup | 82.7 | Nuba | 100.3 |
| L11 | 92.6 | L35 | 60.0 | L59 | 64.1 | L83 | 95.1 | Dwalganup | 96.6 | Nungarin | 96.3 |
| L12 | 76.2 | L36 | 89.0 | L60 | 54.5 | L84 | 99.7 | Enfield | 79.3 | Riverina | 97.4 |
| L13 | 83.4 | L37 | 84.2 | L61 | 65.9 | L85 | 84.1 | Esperance | 95.6 | Rosabrook | 36.8 |
| L14 | 61.3 | L38 | 57.1 | L62 | 96.7 | L86 | 81.8 | Geraldton | 94.6 | Rosedale | 95.1 |
| L15 | 37.0 | L39 | 90.2 | L63 | 75.8 | L87 | 71.4 | Gosse | 96.0 | Tammin | 34.7 |
| L16 | 96.4 | L40 | 61.5 | L64 | 90.0 | L88 | 59.2 | Goulburn | 93.4 | Seaton Park | 91.8 |
| L17 | 96.4 | L41 | 30.5 | L65 | 85.0 | L89 | 72.5 | Green Range | 97.2 | Tallarook | 96.9 |
| L18 | 95.3 | L42 | 83.4 | L66 | 55.0 | L90 | 84.0 | Howard | 93.4 | Trikkala | 95.5 |
| L19 | 82.7 | L43 | 96.9 | L67 | 90.0 | L91 | 97.0 | Izmir | 87.0 | Uniwager | 98.9 |
| L20 | 98.7 | L44 | 81.7 | L68 | 29.7 | L92 | 92.5 | Junee | 99.7 | Urana (L97) | 78.5 |
| L21 | 96.6 | L45 | 45.0 | L69 | 98.5 | L93 | 36.4 | Karridale | 75.9 | Woogenellup | 35.6 |
| L22 | 91.9 | L46 | 65.5 | L70 | 91.6 | L94 | 93.3 | Larisa | 97.0 | Yarloop | 100.1 |
| L23 | 93.3 | L47 | 93.6 | L71 | 98.9 | L95 | 91.7 | Leura | 91.8 | York | 76.5 |
| L24 | 95.6 | L48 | 95.1 | L72 | 89.8 | | | | | | |
| LSD ($P=0.05$) | | 21.1 | | | | | | | | | |

Annual medic

Most annual medic lines were very susceptible to RLEM, with a mean cotyledon damage rating of 56.2% (Table 2). There were large differences between and within species. *Medicago rugosa* was the least susceptible (mean of 17.0%), followed by *M. murex* (mean of 22.5%) and *M. polymorpha* (mean of 39.8%). The most susceptible species were *M. orbicularis*, *M. rotata* and *M. rigidula*, each represented by one line.

Table 2. Predicted means (from AS-REML) for percent cotyledon damage of diverse annual medic, subterranean clover and messina lines following glasshouse screening with RLEM. Resistant and susceptible check varieties, L58 (DGI007) subterranean clover and Jemalong barrel medic, respectively, are shown in bold.

| Line | % damage | Line | % damage | Line | % damage | Line | % damage |
|----------------------------|----------|-----------------------------|-------------|---------------------------|----------|-------------------------------|------------|
| <i>Medicago truncatula</i> | | <i>M. truncatula</i> | | <i>M. italica</i> | | <i>M. polymorpha</i> | |
| APG1316 ^a | 58.9 | APG14163 ^a | 68.4 | Murrayland ^b | 84.3 | APG9615 | 22.8 |
| APG1489 ^a | 61.3 | APG15268 ^a | 68.0 | Rivoli ^b | 61.7 | APG17978 | 37.2 |
| APG1502 ^a | 66.5 | APG15951 ^a | 49.9 | Swani ^b | 32.7 | APG17991 | 32.5 |
| APG2168 ^a | 49.9 | APG17590 ^a | 59.5 | Toreador ^b | 86.1 | APG18010 | 41.5 |
| APG2193 ^a | 28.6 | APG18176 | 39.4 | Tornafield ^b | 47.2 | APG18678 | 5.1 |
| APG2203 ^a | 55.2 | APG18254 | 40.1 | <i>M. littoralis</i> | | APG22540 | 39.8 |
| APG2204 ^a | 49.9 | APG18346 ^a | 63.8 | APG2381 | 80.2 | APG24204 | 49.3 |
| APG2260 | 33.3 | APG18532 ^a | 60.4 | APG2490 | 22.8 | APG25943 | 26.7 |
| APG3047 ^a | 56.4 | APG18543 ^a | 56.8 | Angel ^b | 73.1 | Cavalier ^b | 85.4 |
| APG3054 ^a | 54.4 | APG19961 | 33.8 | Harbinger ^b | 89.1 | Circle Valley ^b | 60.2 |
| APG3116 ^a | 62.4 | APG19964 ^a | 80.9 | Harbinger AR ^b | 92.2 | Santiago ^b | 37.1 |
| APG3562 ^a | 48.2 | APG21362 ^a | 50.8 | Herald ^b | 90.2 | Scimitar ^b | 58.5 |
| APG3646 | 53.6 | APG23859 ^a | 71.6 | Jaguar ^b | 90.1 | Serena ^b | 39.5 |
| APG3916 ^a | 41.1 | APG24576 ^a | 17.1 | Pildappa | 85.4 | Z2100 | 56.1 |
| APG4087 ^a | 56.9 | APG24714 ^a | 65.3 | PM2 | 85.9 | <i>M. rigidula</i> | |
| APG4482 | 54.3 | APG24968 ^a | 40.8 | PM250 | 73.4 | Laramie | 85.5 |
| APG4564 | 56.1 | APG25898 ^a | 78.7 | <i>M. murex</i> | | <i>M. rotata</i> | |
| APG4971 | 49.5 | APG25915 ^a | 61.8 | APG23208 | 9.6 | Highlander | 88.0 |
| APG2840 ^a | 40.9 | APG25941 ^a | 80.5 | Zodiac ^b | 35.3 | <i>M. rugosa</i> | |
| APG6088 ^a | 56.8 | APG27062 ^a | 34.2 | <i>M. sphaerocarpos</i> | | Paragosa ^b | 17.3 |
| APG7627 | 46.4 | APG27137 ^a | 69.7 | Orion ^b | 31.5 | Paraponto ^b | 18.2 |
| APG7749 ^a | 73.7 | APG27138 ^a | 71.1 | <i>M. orbicularis</i> | | Sapo ^b | 15.4 |
| APG8105 ^a | 66.7 | APG27774 ^a | 50.2 | Bindaroo ^b | 97.9 | <i>M. scutellata</i> | |
| APG8454 | 89.7 | APG27882 ^a | 55.9 | <i>M. polymorpha</i> | | Essex ^b | 89.1 |
| APG8496 ^a | 73.9 | APG28064 ^a | 42.0 | APG412 | 50.5 | Kelson ^b | 80.4 |
| APG8625 ^a | 67.8 | APG28375 ^a | 53.8 | APG2606 | 48.6 | Robinson ^b | 80.5 |
| APG8626 ^a | 81.5 | APG28712 ^a | 75.5 | APG2772 | 56.5 | Sair ^b | 74.7 |
| APG8642 ^a | 64.4 | 43 Mt ^a | 79.9 | APG3577 | 30.4 | Sava ^b | 79.4 |
| APG8916 ^a | 82.1 | Borong ^{a,b} | 66.6 | APG3609 | 60.5 | <i>Trifolium subterraneum</i> | |
| APG8935 ^a | 68.2 | Caliph ^{a,b} | 57.0 | APG4042 | 50.7 | L58 (DGI007) | 8.3 |
| APG9138 ^a | 82.0 | Cyfield ^b | 72.3 | APG4169 | 13.3 | Bindoon ^b | 15.6 |
| APG9141 ^a | 68.1 | Cyprus ^b | 59.8 | APG5508 | 45.3 | Dalkeith ^b | 57.0 |
| APG9356 ^a | 81.2 | Jemalong^b | 70.8 | APG5709 | 19.3 | Narrakup ^b | 19.3 |
| APG9357 ^a | 65.9 | Jester ^b | 71.3 | APG5723 | 4.0 | Rosabrook ^b | 13.8 |
| APG9388 | 62.0 | Lucas ^a | 63.5 | APG5727 | 20.0 | Tammin ^b | 19.4 |
| APG9456 ^a | 44.4 | Mogul ^b | 62.7 | APG6336 | 24.0 | Gosse ^b | 73.6 |
| APG9596 ^a | 74.0 | Parabinga ^b | 45.2 | APG6337 | 28.5 | Riverina ^b | 73.7 |
| APG9693 ^a | 51.7 | Sanza | 69.7 | APG7489 | 67.7 | Rouse ^b | 69.2 |
| APG9700 ^a | 68.8 | Sephi ^b | 52.6 | APG7751 | 59.3 | Yanco ^b | 48.2 |
| APG9712 ^a | 73.6 | Sultan-SU ^b | 58.3 | APG8134 | 50.1 | Clare ^b | 44.1 |
| APG9728 ^a | 87.3 | Z2504 | 69.0 | APG8193 | 29.9 | Lofty ^b | 46.0 |
| APG9866 ^a | 67.2 | <i>M. arabica</i> | | APG8234 | 13.4 | Mawson ^b | 64.2 |
| APG9876 ^a | 57.0 | APG8746 | 84.7 | APG8902 | 21.6 | <i>Melilotus siculus</i> | |
| APG10406 ^a | 37.0 | APG8774 | 79.7 | APG9611 | 33.3 | Neptune ^b | 61.1 |
| APG10481 ^a | 48.1 | APG36809 | 35.5 | APG9614 | 55.0 | | |
| LSD ($P=0.05$) | 11.1 | | | | | | |

^aMember of the *M. truncatula* core collection; ^bCultivar

Most annual medic cultivars were highly susceptible, with a mean cotyledon damage rating of 65.0%. However, the three *M. rugosa* cultivars, Paragosa, Sapo and Paraponto, were not significantly different to the

resistant check, DGI007. Several other annual medic lines also had cotyledon damage ratings no different to the resistant control, including *M. murex* line APG23208, *M. polymorpha* lines APG5723, APG18678, APG4169, APG8234 and APG5709 and *M. truncatula* line APG24576. The subterranean clover cultivars Rosabrook, Bindoon, Narrikup and Tammin were also no different to the resistant check, while the other new cultivars (Yanco, Rouse, Mawson and Lofty) and *Melilotus siculus* cv. Neptune were susceptible.

Discussion

The wide diversity of RLEM cotyledon damage ratings among the subterranean clover lines examined confirmed previous findings, with the majority of cultivars being susceptible and the newly released cultivars Bindoon Rosabrook, Narrikup and Tammin having resistance. Of note were ten core collection lines with low RLEM damage scores. The continuous distribution of RLEM cotyledon resistance in the germplasm suggests the trait is multi-genic (Nichols *et al.* 2014); it is not known whether the resistant lines in this study have the same or different genes for resistance. If different genes are present, intercrossing could be conducted to pyramid complementary genes to produce cultivars with greater and more durable resistance. Further genetic analyses are required to identify the different genes involved in resistance.

The finding that most annual medics, including the cultivars, are highly susceptible to RLEM supports the results of Lake and Howie (1995). However, low cotyledon feeding damage scores in the *M. rugosa* cultivars Paragosa, Sapo and Paraponto have not been previously reported. The observation that *M. murex* has lines with resistance also supports the results of Lake and Howie (1995). The identification of some lines with low RLEM feeding damage ratings among the widely sown annual medics, *M. truncatula* and *M. polymorpha*, suggests the potential to develop cultivars of these species with improved RLEM resistance. However, further work is required to understand the genetics of this trait.

Acknowledgements

Funding for this work was provided by Meat & Livestock Australia, as part of the project “Pre-breeding in annual legumes” (project no P.PBE.0037).

References

- Ellwood SR, D' Souza NK, Kamphuis LG, Burgess TI, Nair RM and Oliver RP (2006). SSR analysis of the *Medicago truncatula* SARDI core collection reveals substantial diversity and unusual genotype dispersal throughout the Mediterranean basin. *Theoretical Applied Genetics* 112, 977–983.
- Kaur P, Appels R, Bayer PE, Keeble-Gagnere G, Wang J, Hideki H, Kenta S, Vercoe PE, Stefanova K, Durmic Z, Nichols P, Revell C, Isobe S, Edwards D and Erskine W (2017). Climate clever clovers: New paradigm to reduce the environmental footprint of ruminants by breeding low methanogenic forages utilising haplotype variation. *Frontiers in Plant Science* <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2017.01463>. Accessed 3 March 2019.
- Lake AHW and Howie JH (1995) Selection for redlegged earth mite resistance in annual *Medicago* species. *Plant Protection Quarterly* 10, 45-46.
- Nichols PGH, Foster KJ, Piano E, Pecetti L, Kaur P, Ghamkhar K and Collins WJ (2013). Genetic improvement of subterranean clover (*Trifolium subterraneum* L.). 1. Germplasm, traits and future prospects. *Crop and Pasture Science* 64, 312–346.
- Nichols PGH, Jones RAC, Ridsdill-Smith TJ and Barbetti MJ (2014). Genetic improvement of subterranean clover (*Trifolium subterraneum* L.). 2. Breeding for disease and pest resistance. *Crop and Pasture Science* 65, 1207–1229.
- PBR database (2019). Plant Breeders Rights database. IP Australia, Commonwealth Government of Australia. Available at: <http://www.ipaustralia.gov.au/get-the-right-ip/plant-breeders-rights>. Accessed 3 March 2019.
- Ridsdill-Smith TJ and Nichols PGH (1998). Development of pasture legumes resistant to redlegged earth mite. *Proceedings of the 6th Australasian Applied Entomology Research Conference*, Brisbane, Australia. (Eds MP Zalucki, RAI Drew, GG White), Vol. 2: 382-389. (Horticultural Research & Development Corporation: Brisbane).
- Umina PA (2007). Pyrethroid resistance discovered in a major agricultural pest in southern Australian: the redlegged earth mite *Halotydeus destructor* (Acari: Penthalpidae). *Pest Management Science* 63, 1185–1190.